

# RA

restauro archeologico

Conoscenza, conservazione e valorizzazione  
del patrimonio architettonico  
**Rivista del Dipartimento di Architettura  
dell'Università degli Studi di Firenze**

Knowledge, preservation and enhancement  
of architectural heritage  
**Journal of the Department of Architecture  
University of Florence**

Poste Italiane spa - fascia pagata - Piego di libro Aut. n. 072/DCB/F11/VF del 31.03.2005

**1972/2022**  
**World Heritage in transition**  
About management,  
protection and sustainability

**2022**  
special issue

**1**

FIRENZE  
UNIVERSITY  
PRESS







**Il Patrimonio Mondiale  
alla prova del tempo.**

**A proposito di gestione,  
salvaguardia e sostenibilità**

**Firenze, 18-19 novembre 2022**

**World Heritage in transition**  
**About management, protection and sustainability**  
International Conference (Florence, 18-19 november 2022)

**Le Patrimoine mondial à l'épreuve du temps**  
**Sur la gestion, la protection et la durabilité**  
Colloque international (Florence, 18-19 novembre 2022)

## RA | restauro archeologico

Conoscenza, conservazione e valorizzazione  
del patrimonio architettonico  
**Rivista del Dipartimento di Architettura  
dell'Università degli Studi di Firenze**

Knowledge, preservation and enhancement  
of architectural heritage  
**Journal of the Department of Architecture  
University of Florence**

Anno XXX special issue/2022  
Registrazione Tribunale di Firenze  
n. 5313 del 15.12.2003

ISSN 1724-9686 (print)  
ISSN 2465-2377 (online)

### Director

Giuseppe De Luca  
(Università degli Studi di Firenze)

### Editors in Chief

Susanna Caccia Gherardini,  
Maurizio De Vita  
(Università degli Studi di Firenze)

### Guest Editors

Susanna Caccia Gherardini  
*Università degli Studi di Firenze*

Maurizio De Vita  
*Università degli Studi di Firenze*

Carlo Francini  
*Comune di Firenze*

### INTERNATIONAL SCIENTIFIC BOARD

Hélène Dessales, Benjamin Mouton, Carlo Olmo,  
Zhang Peng, Andrea Pessina, Guido Vannini

### EDITORIAL BOARD

Andrea Arrighetti, Sara Di Resta, Junmei Du,  
Annamaria Ducci, Maria Grazia Ercolino, Rita Fabbri,  
Gioia Marino, Pietro Matracchi, Emanuele Morezzi,  
Federica Ottoni, Andrea Pane, Rosario Scaduto,  
Raffaella Simonelli, Andrea Ugolini, Maria Vitiello

### EDITORIAL STAFF

Francesca Giusti, Virginia Neri,  
Francesco Pisani, Margherita Vicario

### layout revision by

Giorgio Ghelfi, Adele Rossi, Marta Raggi, Margherita Vicario, Salvatore Zocco  
*Università degli Studi di Firenze*

The authors are at the disposal of those who, untraced, were legally entitled to  
payment of any publication rights, subject to the solely scientific character of  
this study and its nonprofit purpose.

### Copyright: © The Author(s) 2022

This is an open access journal distributed under the Creative Commons  
Attribution-ShareAlike 4.0 International License  
(CC BY-SA 4.0: <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0/legalcode>).

### cover photo

Firenze, Grotta del Buontalenti, Giardino di Boboli,  
(123RF)

### cover design

●●● dida**communicationlab**  
**DIDA** Dipartimento di Architettura  
Università degli Studi di Firenze  
via della Mattonaia, 8  
50121 Firenze, Italy

### published by

**Firenze University Press**  
Università degli Studi di Firenze  
Firenze University Press  
Via Cittadella, 7 - 50144 Firenze, Italy  
[www.fupress.com](http://www.fupress.com)



Stampato su carta di pura cellulosa Fedrigoni



**COMITATO PROMOTORE | Promoting  
Committee | Comité de Pilotage**

Susanna Caccia Gherardini  
*Università degli Studi di Firenze*  
Maurizio De Vita  
*Università degli Studi di Firenze*  
Carlo Francini  
*Comune di Firenze*

**COMITATO SCIENTIFICO  
INTERNAZIONALE | International  
Scientific Committee | Comité  
Scientifique International**

Patricia Alberth  
*Site manager Bamberg World Heritage  
/ President International Association of  
World Heritage Professionals (IAWHP)*  
Gianluca Belli  
*University of Florence*  
Chris Blandford  
*President World Heritage UK*  
Wolfgang Börner  
*Municipality of Vienna / ICOMOS  
Austria / Founder of the International  
Conference "Cultural Heritage and New  
Technologies"*  
Susanna Caccia Gherardini  
*Co-director of the academic journal  
«Restauro Archeologico», University of  
Florence*  
Chloé Campo de Montauzon  
*General Delegate of the Association of  
French World Heritage properties*  
Lorenzo Cantoni  
*UNESCO Chair on ICT to Develop and  
Promote Sustainable Tourism at World  
Heritage Sites, Università della Svizzera  
Italiana, Lugano*  
Nicola Casagli  
*UNESCO Chair on the Prevention and  
Sustainable Management of Geo-  
Hydrological Hazards, University of  
Florence*  
Adele Cesi  
*National Focal Point for the World  
Heritage Convention, UNESCO Office of  
the Ministry of Culture, Italy*  
Sarah Court  
*Instead Heritage  
ICCROM / Herculaneum Conservation  
Project*  
Maurizio De Vita  
*Co-director of the academic journal  
«Restauro Archeologico», University of  
Florence*  
Paolo Faccio  
*Iuav University, Venice*  
Emanuela Ferretti  
*University of Florence*  
Donatella Fiorani  
*Sapienza University of Rome*  
Nicole Franceschini  
*International Consultant on World  
Heritage / World Heritage Leadership  
programme, ICCROM*  
Carlo Francini  
*Site manager Historic Centre of Florence,  
Municipality of Florence / Scientific  
Coordinator Association of Italian World  
Heritage sites*  
Maria Cristina Giambruno  
*Polytechnic University of Milan*  
Francesca Giliberto  
*University of Leeds*  
Fergus MacLaren  
*President, ICOMOS International  
Cultural Tourism Committee*

Pietro Matracchi  
*University of Florence*  
Alessandro Merlo  
*University of Florence*  
Giovanni Minutoli  
*University of Florence*  
Anne-Laure Moniot  
*Bordeaux Metropole*  
Stefano Musso  
*Università di Genova*  
Mara Nemela  
*Director, "Dolomiti-Dolomiten-  
Dolomites-Dolomitis UNESCO"  
Foundation*  
Emanuele Pellegrini  
*IMT School for Advanced Studies Lucca*  
Renata Picone  
*University of Naples Federico II*  
Marco Pretelli  
*University of Bologna*  
Alessio Re  
*Fondazione Santagata  
Università degli Studi di Torino*  
Emanuele Romeo  
*Polytechnic University of Turin*  
Paolo Salonia  
*National Research Council / ICOMOS  
Italia*  
Christina Sinclair  
*Director of Edinburgh World Heritage*  
Jane Thompson  
*Instead Heritage / ICCROM /  
Herculaneum Conservation Project /  
SDA Bocconi*  
Michael Turner  
*Bezalel Academy of Arts and Design,  
UNESCO Chair in Urban Design and  
Conservation Studies*

**COMITATO ORGANIZZATIVO |  
Organising Committee | Comité  
d'Organisation**

*Università degli Studi di Firenze*  
Paola Bordoni  
Maddalena Branchi  
Marta Conte  
Elisa Fallani  
Giorgio Ghelfi  
Francesca Giusti  
Gaia Lavoratti  
Giulia Lazzari  
Alessia Montacchini  
Francesco Pisani  
Carlo Ricci  
Loredana Rita Scuto  
Gaia Vannucci  
Margherita Vicario

**CON IL PATROCINIO DI | sponsored by | avec le soutien de**

Ministero degli Affari Esteri e della Cooperazione Internazionale, Ministero della Transizione Ecologica, Ministero della Cultura, Commissione Nazionale Italiana per l'UNESCO, Regione Toscana, International Centre for the Study of the Preservation and Restoration of Cultural Property (ICCROM), ICOMOS Italia Consiglio Internazionale dei Monumenti e dei Siti - Comitato Nazionale Italiano, Associazione Beni Italiani Patrimonio Mondiale, Accademia delle Arti del Disegno.



# Indice | Summary | Index

vol. 1

<b>Carte e convenzioni: evoluzione del concetto di Patrimonio Mondiale</b>   Charters and Conventions: evolution of the notion of World Heritage   Chartes et conventions : l'évolution de la notion de Patrimoine mondial	<b>10</b>
<b>Study on the Recognition and Interpretation of the World Heritage Criterion (ii)</b> “an important interchange of human values” <i>Semina An</i>	12
<b>Synergies for World Heritage</b> <i>Calogero Bellanca, Susana Mora Alonso-Muñoyerro</i>	18
<b>Ampliare un World Heritage Site verso il passato recente. L'opera di Giancarlo De Carlo a Urbino</b> <i>Maria Paola Borgarino, Davide Del Curto</i>	24
<b>Patrimoine collectif des Nations/Patrimoine commun de l'Humanité</b> <b>At the origins of the debate on the conservation of world heritage</b> <i>Susanna Caccia Gherardini</i>	30
<b>La Dichiarazione europea per lo studio del latino e del greco antico: filologia e autenticità dei beni culturali</b> <i>Maria Carolina Campone</i>	36
<b>Conservazione e Ricostruzione: la difficile ricerca di equilibrio nella salvaguardia del Patrimonio Mondiale</b> <i>Donatella Fiorani</i>	42
<b>State of the art of open-air rock art as World Heritage site: past, present and future</b> <i>Estrela C. García García</i>	48
<b>Restauro storici tra riconoscimenti e negazioni nell'interpretazione del Patrimonio Mondiale.</b> <b>Spunti e confronti a partire dal Percorso arabo-normanno di Palermo</b> <i>Carmen Genovese</i>	54
<b>ICOMOS Charters on cultural tourism throughout the 50 years of the UNESCO World Heritage Convention</b> <i>Margaret Gowen, Fergus Maclaren, Celia Martínez, Cecilie Smith-Christensen</i>	60
<b>Oltre le barriere del tempo e dell'autorialità?</b> <b>Osservazioni sul concetto di patrimonio UNESCO</b> <i>Michela Marisa Grisoni</i>	66
<b>Le prochain patrimoine. L'architecture tropicale à Kinshasa</b> <i>Manlio Michieletto, Alexis Tshiunza</i>	72
<b>“Quality” of interventions on built Cultural Heritage</b> <i>Stefano Francesco Musso</i>	78
<b>Patrimonio rurale: percorsi concettuali nelle Carte e nelle Convenzioni (1972-2022)</b> <i>Iole Nocerino</i>	84
<b>50 Years After the World Heritage Convention.</b> <b>An analysis of the evolution of the concepts of Monuments and Authenticity</b> <i>Alessandra Pica</i>	90
<b>Il mausoleo di Oljeitu a Soltaniyeh in Iran.</b> <b>Bilanci e prospettive per un sito UNESCO</b> <i>Francesco Pisani</i>	94

<b>The Porticoes of Bologna and contemporary architecture.</b> <b>A proposal for a Minor Boundary Modification towards Kenzo Tange</b> <i>Marco Pretelli, Ines Tolic</i>	100
<b>The Shift in Paradigm of the (Post)Mining Landscapes, Between Risks and Recognitions</b> <i>Oana Cristina Tiganea, Francesca Vigotti</i>	106
<b>Tutela, salvaguardia e protezione del Patrimonio Mondiale   Protection and safeguarding of World Heritage  </b> <b>Préservation, sauvegarde et protection du Patrimoine mondial</b>	110
<b>20th-Century architectural heritage adaptation to present climate challenges:</b> <b>Interdisciplinary methods for a rational intervention</b> <i>Myriame Ali-oualla, Caroline Mazel</i>	112
<b>Conservazione e nuove frontiere tecniche pluridisciplinari</b> <i>Claudia Aveta</i>	118
<b>Learning from the past: old and new ksour in the M'Zab Valley (Algeria)</b> <i>Cheima Azil, Margherita Vicario</i>	124
<b>Urbino città Patrimonio UNESCO: un piano per la conservazione, valorizzazione e gestione del patrimonio storico – artistico dell'Ateneo</b> <i>Laura Baratin, Alessandra Cattaneo, Francesca Gasparetto, Veronica Tronconi</i>	130
<b>“L'arte dei muri a secco”, confronti tra esperienze per la conservazione del patrimonio culturale dei paesaggi rurali</b> <i>Zaira Barone, Francesco Marchese</i>	136
<b>New Technologies for the Preservation, Conservation and Enhancement of Verona's UNESCO Heritage: The Walls</b> <i>Pietro Becherini</i>	142
<b>I <i>ciabòt</i> del sito UNESCO Langhe-Roero e Monferrato: problematiche di conservazione delle architetture rurali fragili quali componenti storico-culturali dei paesaggi vitivinicoli</b> <i>Giulia Beltramo</i>	148
<b>Rispetta la montagna – Risparmia l'acqua e riduci i rifiuti quando visiti le Dolomiti WHS</b> <i>Elisabeth Berger, Virna Bussadori, Marcella Morandini</i>	154
<b>The safeguarding and enhancement of the Historic and Traditional businesses of the Historical Centre of Florence</b> <i>Stefano Bertocci, Federico Cioli</i>	160
<b>Guerra tra giganti. Il riconoscimento del patrimonio archeologico sardo tra conservazione e accessibilità</b> <i>Bruno Billeci</i>	166
<b>The relation between use and safeguarding: the case study of the Portico of Glory</b> <i>Anna Bonora</i>	172
<b>Il valore della sostenibilità per la conservazione del patrimonio.</b> <b>Riflessioni verso una definizione dei prodotti sostenibili del restauro</b> <i>Paola Bordini</i>	178
<b>Caratteri architettonici e problematiche conservative dei fronti edilizi ottocenteschi del centro storico fiorentino</b> <i>Maddalena Branchi</i>	184
<b>Florence Heritage data System. Un modello di controllo e valutazione per i siti Patrimonio Mondiale</b> <i>Carolina Capitanio, Daniela Chiesi, Martina Franco</i>	190
<b>L'UNESCO e la 'democratizzazione della cultura'. Siti archeologici nel centro antico di Napoli tra accessibilità e fruizione inclusiva</b> <i>Luigi Cappelli, Luigi Veronese</i>	196
<b>Un patrimonio celato fra le architetture moderne di Asmara: avanguardie e sperimentazioni costruttive italiane in terra d'Oltremare</b> <i>Giovanni Carbonara, Pier Pasquale Trausi</i>	202



<b>Il patrimonio della Tirana Moderna: il rapporto tra monumento e città</b> <i>Corrado Castagnaro</i>	208
<b>Marketplace per elementi lapidei di pregio: un'innovativa opportunità per la salvaguardia del patrimonio UNESCO</b> <i>Alessandra Cernaro, Ornella Fiandaca</i>	214
<b>Civilization Lost and Re-discovered, International Efforts for Advocacy and Conservation of Ani Archaeological Site</b> <i>Hunghsi Chao, Jonathan S. Bell</i>	220
<b>Le rôle paradoxal de l'eau à Lalibela (Ethiopie) : Enjeux et méthodes pour la conservation d'un affleurement naturel anthropisé</b> <i>Rémy Chapoulié, Romain Mensan, Loïc Espinasse, Pascal Mora, François Daniel, Emma Lamothe-Dubrocca, Bruno Dutailly, Caroline Delevoie, Vincent Baillet, Kidane Ayalew, Marie-Laure Derat</i>	226
<b>Integration and BIM digitization of interdisciplinary research and diagnostic campaigns for knowledge and conservation: Palazzo Vecchio in Florence</b> <i>Anna Livia Ciuffreda, Massimo Coli, Marco Tanganelli, Giorgio Verdiani</i>	232
<b>Monitorare per conservare: il caso della Torre Ghirlandina di Modena</b> <i>Eva Coïsson, Lia Ferrari, Elena Zanazzi</i>	238
<b>Distruzione, protezione e restauro in Italia a seguito di eventi bellici</b> <i>Daniela Concas, Roberto Nadalin</i>	244
<b>Il patrimonio residenziale Moderno e il problema della certificazione: interventi sostenibili per la conservazione</b> <i>Giuseppina Currò, Fabio Minutoli</i>	250
<b>Firenze Novecento fra conoscenza, tutela e pianificazione</b> <i>Maurizio De Vita</i>	256
<b>Fabbriche di mattoni - fabbriche di cultura. La riconversione di forni Hoffmann sul litorale abruzzese e laziale</b> <i>Daniela Di Donato, Matteo Abita, Alessandra Bellicoso</i>	262
<b>Tecnologie digitali e consapevolezza culturale</b> <i>Marco Di Paolo, Stefania Raschi</i>	268
<b>Il Progetto 4CH per un Centro di Competenza per la Conservazione del Patrimonio Culturale: nuove tecnologie a supporto della tutela</b> <i>Giulia Favaretto, Danila Longo, Serena Orlandi, Rossella Roversi, Beatrice Turillazzi</i>	274
<b>Il sistema informativo territoriale della "Carta del rischio del patrimonio culturale italiano" e i siti UNESCO italiani: un processo virtuoso per il monitoraggio della vulnerabilità dei beni patrimonio mondiale</b> <i>Angela Maria Ferroni, Carlo Cacace</i>	282
<b>Il complesso delle Ville di Oplontis. Strategie per il restauro e il miglioramento della fruizione del sito UNESCO</b> <i>Ersilia Fiore</i>	292
<b>Ricerca e conservazione sul patrimonio costruito: Casina Spinelli ad Acerra</b> <i>Raffaella Fiorillo</i>	298
<b>Frank Lloyd Wright's World Heritage throughout Time. The complex compromise between use and conservation in the American approach to architectural restoration</b> <i>Davide Galleri</i>	304
<b>Quale 'restauro' per i siti patrimonio dell'Umanità. Riflessioni a partire da alcuni casi studio nei Paesi emergenti</b> <i>Mariacristina Giambruno, Sonia Pistidda</i>	310
<b>Amatrice avant Amatrice : Une méthode de travail pour l'étude, la documentation et la conservation d'un village perdu</b> <i>Simone Lucchetti</i>	316
<b>Fonti e strumenti digitali per la conoscenza e la tutela del patrimonio costruito di Roma</b> <i>Nicoletta Marconi, Ilaria Giannetti, Valentina Florio</i>	322

<b>Il complesso termale Tettuccio a Montecatini Terme. Un patrimonio da svelare</b> <i>Pietro Matracchi, Alessio Prandin</i>	328
<b>Nuove tecnologie e sostenibilità: dal rilievo alla comunicazione per il Museo di Casa Romei di Ferrara, città Patrimonio UNESCO</b> <i>Gianmarco Mei, Cristian Boscaro, Stefano Costantini, Manuela Incerti</i>	334
<b>Nuove strategie per il piano di gestione del verde di Parchi e Giardini storici alla luce delle mutate condizioni ambientali e di fruizione</b> <i>Alberto Minelli, Paola Viola</i>	340
<b>Strumenti BIM e GIS per la gestione della manutenzione e salvaguardia della Fortezza veneziana di Bergamo</b> <i>Virna Maria Nannei, Vittorio Paris, Giuseppe Ruscica, Giulio Mirabella Roberti</i>	346
<b>Spazi in attesa nelle Residenze Sabaude, Patrimonio Mondiale dal 1997. Previsioni di restauro e messa a sistema nell'obiettivo della sostenibilità culturale</b> <i>Monica Naretto</i>	352
<b>La conoscenza per il recupero dei 'valori' del passato: il caso della chiesa della Madonna delle Vergini a Matera</b> <i>Antonello Pagliuca, Giuseppe D'Angiulli</i>	358
<b>Nuove tecnologie per conoscere e valorizzare il Patrimonio: "itinerari culturali" nella città di Ascoli Piceno</b> <i>Enrica Petrucci, Sara Cipolletti</i>	364
<b>Ripensare i confini. La città antica di Pompei e i siti minori del Parco archeologico nella buffer zone vesuviana</b> <i>Renata Picone</i>	370
<b>The archaeology of architecture for the knowledge and preservation of the 'modern'</b> <i>Daniela Pittaluga</i>	378
<b>L'Imperiale Palazzo de' Pitti. Conservazione e valorizzazione</b> <i>Elena Pozzi</i>	384
<b>Strategie per la conoscenza e il restauro del Paesaggio Culturale. Il caso dell'antico vigneto e del Palazzo Mansi ex Palazzo Vescovile di Scala (Sa)</b> <i>Giulia Proto</i>	390
<b>Strategie per la conservazione integrata di un patrimonio a rischio, tra fruizione e tutela: il sito UNESCO della Costiera Amalfitana</b> <i>Giuseppina Pugliano</i>	396
<b>Il patrimonio scomparso di Guarino Guarini per l'Ordine dei Chierici Regolari Teatini: catalogazione con l'impiego di nuove tecnologie</b> <i>Rossana Ravesi</i>	402
<b>Protezione del colore nel Patrimonio Mondiale. La pelle del Cenador del León nel Real Alcázar di Siviglia</b> <i>María Dolores Robador González</i>	408
<b>Innovative techniques integrating advanced and bio-composite materials for energy and seismic retrofitting of built heritage</b> <i>Rosa Romano, Alessandra Donato, Valerio Alecci, Paola Gallo</i>	414
<b>Di pietre e d'acqua. La conservazione del patrimonio proto-industriale nel paesaggio culturale della Costiera Amalfitana</b> <i>Valentina Russo, Stefania Pollone</i>	420
<b>La Convenzione UNESCO del 1972 nel XXI secolo e la trasformazione Digitale Tecnologica Antropologica, una riflessione</b> <i>Paolo Salonia</i>	426
<b>La verifica di un de restauro come criterio per una riflessione necessaria. La Villa Romana del Casale di Piazza Armerina (Enna), dal 1997 nella World Heritage List</b> <i>Rosario Scaduto</i>	432
<b>E l'acqua si fa luce: la rigenerazione di un patrimonio cambiato di segno</b> <i>Chiara Simoncini</i>	440

<b>Recupero e valorizzazione dei mercati ittici: un patrimonio architettonico e sociale da conoscere e riqualificare</b> <i>Valentina Spagnoli, Claudio Piferi</i>	446
<b>Il Patrimonio mondiale religioso inaccessibile. Conservazione e fruizione ampliata</b> <i>Adriana Trematerra</i>	452
<b>Florence and the Renaissance art works: the importance of the seismic safety</b> <i>Stefania Viti, Francesco Trovatelli</i>	458
<b>Methodology for Establishing the Appropriate Protected Area based on the Analysis of Old Drawings In case of Gia Long Mausoleum, Hue</b> <i>Hiroki Yamada, Shigeru Satoh, Shigeo Tanaka, Yukihiro Hirai, Susumu Kawahara, Keisuke Sugano</i>	464
<b>Il soft power della Lista del Patrimonio Mondiale   The soft power of the World Heritage List   Le soft power de la Liste du Patrimoine mondial</b>	470
<b>Patrimonio per la Pace in un Mondo Pieno di Conflitti</b> <i>Mesut Dinler</i>	472
<b>Changing Approaches of the 1972 Convention's Stake-holders. Historic Areas of Istanbul, Türkiye</b> <i>Asli Hetemoglu, Yesim Tonga-Uriarte</i>	478
<b>Cultural Heritage "on prescription": heritage-led challenges for the societal wellbeing</b> <i>Giulia Mezzalama</i>	484
<b>UNESCO World Heritage Sites in China's cultural diplomacy: Fostering mutual understanding along the Silk Roads</b> <i>Martina Tullio, Gianluca Sampaolo</i>	490
<b>Lost and found: the water-based settlement of the historic city of Ayutthaya</b> <i>Patiphol Yodsurang</i>	496



## **Il soft power della Lista del Patrimonio Mondiale**

The soft power of the World Heritage List

Le soft power de la Liste du Patrimoine mondial



# UNESCO World Heritage Sites in China's cultural diplomacy: Fostering mutual understanding along the Silk Roads

**Martina Tullio** | [m.tullio@unimc.it](mailto:m.tullio@unimc.it)

University of Macerata

**Gianluca Sampaolo** | [gianluca.sampaolo@unimc.it](mailto:gianluca.sampaolo@unimc.it)

University of Macerata

## Abstract

The adoption of the World Heritage Convention (WHC) in 1972 was the response to a world asking for peace after the destruction caused by the two world conflicts, particularly to cultural heritage (CH). UNESCO World Heritage Sites (WHS) act as enablers in establishing strong and effective relationships among countries, people, culture and history, while influencing and attracting these elements to promote a positive national image and fostering mutual understanding, which is the main objective of cultural diplomacy (CD). This holds true also for China and this institutes the need to investigate on how UNESCO World Heritage acts as a strategic asset in Chinese CD. This paper will provide an empirical framework addressing the position of WHS embedded in the Chinese CD. Discussion on the growing Chinese involvement of WHS in cultural projects fostering international relations and considerations on the potential impact and future development of this phenomenon with regards to China and the WHC are offered.

## Keywords

World Heritage, Cultural Diplomacy, China, Soft Power, Silk Roads.

## UNESCO and China's cultural engagement in the World Heritage Convention

UNESCO WHS along the Silk Roads (SR) represent vehicles of paramount importance for China to pursue its CD and disseminate its cultural values. In the Chinese context, CD represents a powerful tool with regards to a nation whose integration with the world fuels and shapes the academic debate both on the CH realm<sup>1</sup> and the international political-economy realm (IPE)<sup>2</sup>, although the latter lacks a more-in depth analysis on how China's rich cultural and intellectual traditions influence its global integration. The case of China is worth mentioning because of the uniqueness of its model and political system which govern the cultural development and manage the CH of the country<sup>3</sup>. The first key argument advanced by this paper is that, in order to better depict the Chinese cultural development and commitment to the WHC in the 50 years since its adoption, it is necessary to delve into the historical and institutional path that China took through the years. It shows how CH assumed different relevance based on the country' strategic objectives. During the first decades of the People's Republic of China (PRC), the adoption of an international treaty concerning the protection of cultural and natural heritage - and interests in international affairs in general - did not align with the historical turmoil and political changes and was not a priority in the country's national agenda in those years. Although it had been a founding member

of UNESCO in 1945, China's commitment to UNESCO only started from the '80s. The adoption and ratification of the WHC in 1985 coincided with a moment of vibrant and flourishing international cooperation which China wanted to embrace. As a matter of fact, the *Reform and Opening-up Policy* launched by the Chinese leader Deng Xiaoping in 1978 signified – although gradual and progressive – openness on all counts, particularly culturally. The establishment of the National Commission for UNESCO in 1979 was the most significant sign that officialized the country's cultural opening-up and willingness to international cooperation<sup>4</sup>. Looking at the success of other countries, but aiming at resisting Western ideologies' influence, China developed a new regulatory regime favoring tourism and heritage-centered economic purposes through a selected use of cultural tradition<sup>5</sup>. Since the 1980s, official references to China's cultural tradition have been growing at a rapid pace and culture protection assumed a prominent position that ultimately resulted in China's numerous inscriptions on the UNESCO World Heritage List (WHL) from 1987. Although one of the major elements that contributed to the Chinese success in the effective implementation of the WHC was the ability to promote a positive image of the country, the so-called Chinese economic miracle generated, in turn, a strong debate on the challenges posed by China's integration and expansion on the international arena<sup>6</sup>. The SR is perfectly positioned in such a debate. As a matter of fact, the second key point this paper wants to disentangle is how China developed its own narrative and how this is used to promote an analogous initiative with economic and foreign policy objectives, the Belt and Road Initiative (BRI). Due to its ambitious goals and global relevance, the BRI has been vastly analyzed by scholars and pundits as China's biggest manifestation of its variegated integration to the world with relevant implications contesting both the notion of the CH and IPE paradigms<sup>7</sup>. A basic departure point of this research is that it considers the Chinese narrative playing a fundamental role in the successful engagement with the outside world and, thus, in the successful implementation of the BRI. A narrative centered on the historical SR heritage that manifests itself through soft power' (SP) strategies and mechanisms of CD. To this regard, it is useful to offer an outline of how this narrative is constructed based on the abovementioned scholarships and discuss its relevance in forging and projecting a positive image of the country.

### **UNESCO World Heritage Sites in China's cultural diplomacy along the Silk Roads**

Historical narratives and discourses are essential to the construction of heritage. The Chinese narrative itself is a heritage constructed throughout four thousand years of history. In particular, the use of SR narrative predates the BRI and reveals to revolve around three main elements that build on both historical and contemporary references. The first is the revitalization of the past that leverages on historical figures who traveled along the ancient SR and positively contributed to the encounter of people<sup>8</sup>. Second, this reference can also be used to revitalize the heritage of the SR Spirit<sup>9</sup>, as outlined in the document *Vision and Actions on Jointly Building Silk Road Economic Belt and 21st-Century Maritime Silk Road*, published in 2015 to delineate the guidelines of the BRI. The concept of the SR Spirit is specified as the spirit of «peace and cooperation, openness and inclusiveness, mutual learning and mutual benefit» that was developed more than two thousand years ago when «the diligent and courageous people of Eurasia explored and opened up several routes of trade and cultural exchanges»<sup>10</sup>. Furthermore, the image of the SR as a path that starts in China to reach the outside world is not only considered particularly appealing for the Chinese domestic public but also useful to open communications with external

actors<sup>11</sup>. In this sense, the SR rhetoric is unique and beneficial as it allows underlining the shared historical heritage of different states<sup>12</sup>. The SR offers the possibility to find points of cultural connection through the language of shared heritage to gain regional influence and loyalty<sup>13</sup>. In the particular case of the PRC, while domestically the ancient SR is connected with a positive image of China, more recently the BRI exploits the common heritage of the SR as a tool to project the same image internationally<sup>14</sup>. This can be primarily achieved by developing *people-to-people bonds* identified as one of the main cooperation priorities for the BRI in the Vision and Actions document. It is exactly this third element of the narrative that can be considered the very tool disseminated in China's SP strategies enhancing the effectiveness of CD linked to the BRI. When it comes to China's application of SP, the ability to affect other countries resonates in the power of discourse based on persuasion<sup>15</sup>, rather on coercion, which is connected to the development of the BRI. The Chinese leadership proved to understand the relevance of strategic narratives. President Xi Jinping's launch of the BRI in 2013 elevated the SP strategy to a higher level in terms of the width of the vision and the extent of other countries' involvement. To this regard, it is noteworthy that when referring to the BRI, Chinese authorities use the term *strategy* when addressing the Chinese public but prefer the less aggressive one of *initiative* with outsiders<sup>16</sup>. Furthermore, Xi Jinping underlines the necessity to build a «community of shared destiny» that, beyond infrastructural connectivity, would entail the ideas of exchange and values. In this context, the BRI became the instrument employed by the PRC to connect such a community, using public diplomacy to foster the acceptance of this project. Hence, the use of the heritage of the SR can be considered part of a «discursive strategy» that allows engaging outsiders<sup>17</sup>. Extant literature highlights the SP components of the BRI and shows how the CH connected to the ancient SR became an instrument for the Chinese narrative connected to the BRI<sup>18</sup>. Recent scholarship shows how Chinese SP strategies have been unfolded internationally, successfully resonating in Africa<sup>19</sup>, and showing different patterns of projections across groups of countries<sup>20</sup>. In this context, the BRI employs CD to internationalize Chinese culture, not only relying on economic cooperation but also on people-to-people relations<sup>21</sup>. The people-to-people aspect of the initiative are exemplified in projects focusing on culture, education, science, and tourism<sup>22</sup>. In fact, since 2013 the BRI has involved investments in cultural and international cooperation, in projects regarding art, cinematography, museums, CH, tourism, etc<sup>23</sup>. In the educational sphere enhancing the BRI, Confucius Institutes, Chinese universities, and educational programs were founded abroad<sup>24</sup>. Finally, an additional priority of people-to-people diplomacy efforts is international cooperation in the promotion of CH. In this sense, the inscription of the site *Silk Roads: the Routes Network of Chang'an-Tianshan Corridor* in the WHL in 2014<sup>25</sup>, represents the main example that as a natural consequence, spurred other countries' interest in the heritage of the SR and in joining other inscriptions of this kind<sup>26</sup>. It is upon this scholarship, then, that this paper builds further explicitly aiming to relate the WHC and inherent WHS along the SR as strategic assets for China to build its SP and exert its CD. To this regard, the following first studies the origins of the UNESCO SR Project and then reveals how its significance as a cultural route instigated a stronger interest to the transnationalization of properties inscribed on the WHL. Moreover, this section analyzes how WHS confers legitimacy to the Chinese narrative, which lies behind its foreign policy initiative, the BRI. As noted above, UNESCO was established after a period of international crises due to World War II that launched a universal narrative thread centered around the word peace. Building on this assumption, the UNESCO SR Program traces back to the first attempt to increase international awareness

about the history of Eurasian connectivity, the *Integral Study of the Silk Roads: Roads of Dialogue*. Challenged by operational factors and issues of under-representation of the Central Asia region on the WHL, the International Council of Monuments and Sites (ICOMOS) conducted a thematic study aiming at providing a wider overview of the nature of sites along these vast routes, *The Silk Roads: an ICOMOS Thematic Study*<sup>27</sup>. Parallel to the analysis conducted to describe the elements of the Chinese narrative inherent to the SR, below we propose an analysis of the mechanisms underlying the WHC and the relevance of the WHS as part of UNESCO-promoted SR Program, in compliance with the main arguments of our research. On one hand, the reference to historical revitalization in the Chinese narrative leads to one figure in particular, Admiral Zheng He, who embodies China's grand narrative of region-wide trade, encounter, and exchange along the Maritime Silk Routes (MSR)<sup>28</sup>. The Chinese interest in the MSR from a cultural perspective was officially manifested with the promotion of the meeting of UNESCO experts for the World Heritage Nomination Process of the MSR<sup>29</sup>. However, in addition to the museums, mosques, and artefacts now appearing around the region celebrating his voyages, China financed countries that are key nodes in the modern-day BRI infrastructure network to support the search for remains of Zheng He's fleet, beyond the construction of port infrastructure. Interestingly, foreign political leaders leverage on the historical narrative represented by Zheng He's voyages to help raise public awareness about each countries' maritime history and connections to China that are explicitly invoked to build domestic support for the strategic engagement in the BRI. Given the networked nature of the initiative, over the coming years we will potentially see other states dig into – both physically and discursively – their own maritime pasts and build heritage industries and museums around stories of trade, connection, and exchange<sup>30</sup>. This represents a great opportunity for China to cooperate with those countries that Zheng He's voyages navigated along the MSR and inscribe transboundary sites on the WHL based on shared heritage and history. On the other hand, scholars noted that the SP generated by the BRI holds the ambitious objective of making China a leader of CD<sup>31</sup>. However, we contend that the 56 WHS inscribed on the Chinese WHL are already some evidence that confers China such a leadership. A sort of charming calling card holding tremendous potential when it comes to the nomination of those sites along the SR not yet inscribed on the WHL, not to mention transnational ones. Remarkably, the historical narrative based on the shared heritage along with the impact represented by these potential nominations will fuel the Chinese narrative which, in turn, will give significant impetus to the BRI. In practice, WHS function as powerful tools backing the implementation of the «community of a shared destiny» endorsed by Xi Jinping.

### **Final remarks: China's cultural diplomacy and the future of the WHC**

Delving into the mutually reinforcing concepts of the SR and BRI shows that connectivity - both economic and cultural - reduces suspicion and promotes common prosperity, as demonstrated by the history of the ancient SR<sup>32</sup>. For many in the Central Asia region, the Silk Road is a story of peaceful trade, and a rich history of religious and harmonious cultural exchange. The BRI seeks to directly build on this legacy. The Chinese narrative attached to the Silk Roads is the story China is now telling the world to boost its SP and exert CD, assuming that the “cultural capital” at the basis of the country's SP comes not only from its successful economic model but also from its glorious past which ultimately suggests a glorious future through the BRI<sup>33</sup>. Altogether, the analysis above highlights a characteristic polymorphic China's integration with the world<sup>34</sup>, which we contend to make

for a polymorphic interpretation of the future of the WHC. This raises structural considerations concerning the notion of CH and the role of the WHC. From an IPE perspective, the spatial paradigms inherent in the SR vision are challenging a dominant feature of the global political economy<sup>35</sup>. From a CH perspective, this envisages a notion of multiculturalism. Given the Sino-centric view of the SR, it might be the case of a China-induced multiculturalism where corridors, nodes, sea routes would generate new cultural basins and, thus, new categories where to conceptualize novel understandings of CH. In this respect, there is big room for the people-to-people connectivity acting as the driving force at the basis of a widespread mutual understanding encompassing a wide array of nation states across the Eurasian and African continents. Demographic shifts and confluence of people and cultures across these vast geographic spaces will bring about socio-economic and political factors that necessarily imply to consider culture among the wider political economic dynamics. A fundamental question to ask is how the WHC will evolve vis-à-vis these developments. In contemporary times, the WHC is already challenged by lobbying mechanisms that raise credibility concerns<sup>37</sup>. In their participation at UNESCO's World Heritage Committee, State Parties now regularly use this language of shared heritage to endorse each other's nominations. World Heritage has thus become an important platform for identifying trade, religious and other connections from the past as the basis for future cooperation<sup>36</sup>. Adding to this, the impact of a successful implementation of the BRI that besides economic interests could spur a shared culture and identity framework, incontestably requires the WHC to govern and harmonize enormous geocultural outcomes. How existing institutions - governmental and non-governmental - and relevant stakeholders - architects, anthropologists, policy-makers - operate in a context of new cultural basins will be a crucial factor. New professionals and experts working in the cultural development of mankind are required to cope with new socio-cultural infrastructures and dynamics. As for policy suggestion, UNESCO should play an active yet neutral role as both guarantor and promoter of transboundary inscriptions from under-represented State Parties on the WHL. This has twofold benefits. On one hand, more inscriptions of such kind would foster the representative, balanced and credibility of the WHL. On the other, it would limit the Sino-centric narrative of the SR. As for the contribution to the scholarship, the BRI is probably the most significant initiative in the history of the world that fosters international cooperation and the encounter between people, which is ultimately one of the main objectives and ambitions of the WHC. Considering the great geopolitical and geocultural implications cultural specialists have done little to apply their more recent insights to the issues that most concern international relations scholars<sup>37</sup>. Beyond geopolitics and IPE dynamics usually scrutinized in academic research when it comes to China's integration with the world, more attention should be placed on the adoption of an interdisciplinary approach that includes the analysis of cultural dynamics underlying and shaping international relations and governance. We argue that the UNESCO WHC - and the Chinese commitment to it - stands as the iconic platform to disclose the interdependence and the mutually reinforcing trend of such dynamics.



- <sup>1</sup> TIM WINTER, *Geocultural Power. China's Quest to Revive the Silk Roads for the Twenty-First Century*, The University of Chicago Press, 2019; CAROLA CHIUSI, *The Belt and Road Initiative as China's pathway towards soft power*, «Public and Cultural Diplomacy», 2021, pp. 1-21.
- <sup>2</sup> NANA DE GRAAF ET AL., *China's rise in a liberal world order in transition – introduction to the FORUM*, «Review of International Political Economy», 2020, pp. 191-207; MAXIMILIAN MAYER & XIN ZHANG, *Theorizing China-world integration: sociospatial reconfigurations and the modern silk roads*, «Review of International Political Economy», 2020.
- <sup>3</sup> WANG TAO & LUCA ZAN, *Management and Presentation of Chinese Sites for UNESCO World Heritage List*, vol. XXIX «Facilities», 2011, pp. 313-325.
- <sup>4</sup> SUSAN WHITFIELD, *The Expanding Silk Road: UNESCO and BRI*, «Bulletin of the Museum of Far Eastern Antiquities», 2021.
- <sup>5</sup> SIMONA NOVARETTI, «Collect gold in times of trouble, collect jade in good times»: private market, public engagement and the protection of cultural property in the People's Republic of China, «Aedon», 2017.
- <sup>6</sup> UNESCO, *China World Heritage List*, 2022.
- <sup>7</sup> LIN MAO, *Between Tradition and Modernity: Wuzhen and China's Soft Power in the 21st Century*, «Journal of Literature and Art Studies», 2017.
- <sup>8</sup> TIM WINTER, *Geocultural Power...*, op. cit., p. 149.
- <sup>9</sup> WEIDONG LIU & MICHAEL DUNFORD, *Inclusive globalization: unpacking China's Belt and Road Initiative*, «Area Development and Policy», 2016.
- <sup>10</sup> NDRC, MOFA, MOC OF THE PRC, *Vision and actions on jointly building Silk Road economic belt and 21st century maritime Silk Road*, 2015.
- <sup>11</sup> MARCIN KACZMARSKI, *The New Silk Road: a versatile instrument in China's policy*, «OSW Center for Eastern Studies», 2015.
- <sup>12</sup> TIMUR DADABAEV, «Silk Road» as foreign policy discourse: The construction of Chinese, Japanese and Korean engagement strategies in Central Asia, «Journal of Eurasian Studies», 2018, pp. 1-12.
- <sup>13</sup> TIM WINTER, *Heritage Diplomacy along the One Belt One Road*, «The newsletter – International Institutes for Asian Studies», 2016, pp. 8-10.
- <sup>14</sup> DAHLIA PATRICIA STERLING, *A New Era in Cultural Diplomacy: Promoting the Image of China's "Belt and Road" Initiative in Asia*, 2018, «Open Journal of Social Sciences», pp. 102-106.
- <sup>15</sup> JOSEPH NYE, *Soft Power*, 1990, «Foreign Policy», pp. 153-171.
- <sup>16</sup> CAROLA CHIUSI, *The Belt and Road Initiative...*, op. cit., pp. 1-21.
- <sup>17</sup> Ibidem.
- <sup>18</sup> DAHLIA PATRICIA STERLING, *A New Era in Cultural Diplomacy...*, op. cit., pp. 102-106.
- <sup>19</sup> WEI LIANG, *China's soft power in Africa: is economic power sufficient?*, «Asian Perspective», 2012, pp. 667-692.
- <sup>20</sup> TIES DAMS ET AL., *China's soft power in Europe. Falling on Hard Times*, «ETNC Report», 2021.
- <sup>21</sup> DAHLIA PATRICIA STERLING, *A New Era in Cultural Diplomacy...*, op. cit., pp. 102-106.
- <sup>22</sup> CAROLA CHIUSI, *The Belt and Road Initiative...*, op. cit., pp. 1-21.
- <sup>23</sup> TIM WINTER, *Silk road diplomacy: Geopolitics and histories of connectivity*, «International Journal of Cultural Policies», 2020, pp. 898-912.
- <sup>24</sup> CAROLA CHIUSI, *The Belt and Road Initiative...*, op. cit., pp. 1-21.
- <sup>25</sup> UNESCO, *China World Heritage List*, 2022; TIM WINTER, *Geocultural Power...*, op. cit., p. 140-155.
- <sup>26</sup> TIM WINTER, *Heritage Diplomacy...*, op. cit., pp. 8-10.
- <sup>27</sup> TIM WILLIAMS, ICOMOS, *The Silk Roads: an ICOMOS Thematic Study*, 2014.
- <sup>28</sup> TIM WINTER, *Heritage Diplomacy...*, op. cit., pp. 8-10.
- <sup>29</sup> UNESCO, *UNESCO Expert Meeting for the World Heritage Nomination Process of the Maritime Silk Routes*, 2017.
- <sup>30</sup> TIM WINTER, *Heritage Diplomacy...*, op. cit., pp. 8-10.
- <sup>31</sup> FENGQI QIAN, *Ancient route, new dream: the Silk Roads and China's Belt and Road Initiative*, «Journal of Cultural Heritage», «Management and Sustainable Development», pp. 45-57.
- <sup>32</sup> TIM WINTER, *Heritage Diplomacy...*, op. cit., pp. 8-10.
- <sup>33</sup> CAROLA CHIUSI, *The Belt and Road Initiative...*, op. cit., pp. 1-21.
- <sup>34</sup> NANA DE GRAAF ET AL., *China's rise in a liberal world order...*, op. cit., pp. 200-207.
- <sup>35</sup> TIM SUMMERS, *China's 'new Silk Roads': sub-national regions and networks of global political economy*, «Third World Quarterly», s. IX, vol. XXXVII, 2016, pp. 1635-1637.
- <sup>36</sup> TIM WINTER, *Heritage Diplomacy...*, op. cit., pp. 8-10.
- <sup>37</sup> TIM WINTER, *Geocultural Power...*, op. cit.



Finito di stampare da  
Rubbettino | Soveria Mannelli (CZ)  
**Università degli Studi di Firenze**



